# **AGENCY STRATEGIC PLAN**

# FISCAL YEARS 2019 TO 2023

# **BY THE**

# CREDIT UNION DEPARTMENT STATE OF TEXAS

#### CREDIT UNION COMMISSION OF TEXAS

#### **Commission Member**

Allyson "Missy" Morrow, Chair Elizabeth L. "Liz" Bayless Beckie Stockstill Cobb Yusuf E. Farran Steven "Steve" Gilman Sherri Brannon Merket James L. "Jim" Minge Barbara "Kay" Stewart Ricky E. "Rick" Ybarra

#### **Dates of Term**

May 23, 2007 to February 15, 2019 April 25, 2018 to February 15, 2019 July 16, 2015 to February 15, 2021 July 16, 2015 to February 15, 2021 July 16, 2015 to February 15, 2021 April 13, 2011 to February 15, 2023 May 21, 2017 to February 15, 2019 May 21, 2017 to February 15, 2023

#### Hometown

San Benito, Texas Austin, Texas Deer Park, Texas El Paso, Texas Katy, Texas Midland, Texas Arlington, Texas Lone Star, Texas Austin, Texas

<b>DATE OF SUBMISSION, JUNE 8, 2018</b>	
SIGNED: Harold E. Feeney, Commissioner	
APPROVED: Allycon "Missy" Morrow Commission Ch	

Allyson "Missy" Morrow, Commission Chair

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

## PART 1 STRATEGIC PLAN

Title Page	Page 1
Table of Contents	Page 2
Agency Mission	Page 3
Agency Philosophy	Page 3
Agency Overview	Page 3
Agency Operational Goals and Action Plan	Page 4
Goal 1. To Ensure A Safe And Sound Credit Union Industry	Page 4
Goal 2. To provide a flexible regulatory framework that enables credit	
unions to provide a full competitive array of financial services	Page 5
Goal 3. To safeguard the interest of credit union members	Page 7
Goal 4. To develop a professional and motivated staff that provides quality	
service to the citizens of Texas and supports achievement of the	
statutory mission.	Page 8
Redundancies and Impediments	Page 11

## PART 2. SUPPLEMENTAL ELEMENTS

Schedule A: Budget Structure	Page 12
Schedule B: Performance Measure Definitions	Page 14
Schedule C: Historically Underutilized Business Plan	Page 20
Schedule D: Statewide Capital Planning	Page 22
Schedule E: Health and Human Services Strategic Planning	Page 22
Schedule F: Agency Workforce Plan and the Texas Workforce System Strategic	
Plan	Page 23
Schedule G: Report on Customer Service	Page 30

### AGENCY MISSION

The mission of the Credit Union Department is to safeguard the public interest, protect the financial interests of credit union members, and promote public confidence in the credit union industry in accordance with TEX. FIN. CODE §15.102.

#### AGENCY PHILOSOPHY

The Credit Union Department will serve the public, credit unions and their members, exercising the highest standards of regulatory oversight, emphasizing professionalism and personal ethics. The Department will guide credit unions toward continuous improvement in financial strength and effectiveness in the provision of financial services to their members. Supervision and examination will be fairly and consistently administered as appropriate to ensure fiscal integrity of the industry. Preservation of public confidence in credit unions and the protection of members' interests, and shares and deposits of credit unions will remain a principal focal point of the agency. This will be accomplished through effective regulation and open communication with credit unions and the general public.

#### AGENCY OVERVIEW

The Credit Union Department ("Department"), under the oversight of the Credit Union Commission ("Commission"), is charged with assuring the safety and soundness of state-chartered credit unions in Texas. The agency also oversees branches of out-of-state credit unions operating in the state.

### AGENCY GOALS AND ACTION PLAN

#### AGENCY OPERATIONAL GOAL AND ACTION PLAN

Goal 1. To ensure a safe and sound credit union industry.

### SPECIFIC ACTION ITEMS TO ACHIEVE YOUR GOAL

- 1. The Department anticipates, understands, addresses, and communicates risk to credit unions.
- 2. The Department cooperates with other regulatory authorities on common interests.
- 3. Supervisory methods and analytical tools keep pace with industry changes and appropriately support the broader mission of the Department.

# DESCRIBE HOW YOUR GOAL OR ACTION ITEMS SUPPORTS EACH STATEWIDE OBJECTIVE

- 1. Accountable to tax and fee payers of Texas.
  - Ensuring no state funds are spent on Department operations; as a self-directed, semiindependent agency, the Department's revenue is derived from state chartered credit unions fees and assessments.
  - Being a prudent steward of its financial resources.
  - Providing transparency through its reporting.
  - Establishing the appropriate regulatory framework.
  - Complying with the examination requirements of 7 TEXAS ADMIN. CODE (TAC) Section 97.105.
- 2. Efficient such that maximum results are produced with a minimum waste of taxpayer funds, including through the elimination of redundant and non-core functions.
  - Ensuring risk-based supervision is properly implemented and focused on material risks to the industry and individual credit unions.
  - Identifying emerging risk areas related to industry and individual credit unions.
  - Working effectively with the NCUA, private share insurance providers, and other state regulators to identify and address risks and emerging issues.
  - Resolving problem credit unions in a timely fashion, effectively, and when possible, without loss to the share insurance provider.
- 3. Effective in successfully fulfilling core functions, measuring success in achieving performance measures and implementing plans to continuously improve.
  - Resolving problem credit unions in a timely fashion, effectively, and when possible, without loss to the share insurance provider.
  - Ensuring risk-based supervision is properly implemented and focused on material risks to the industry and individual credit unions.
  - Identifying emerging risk areas related to industry and individual credit unions.
  - Taking prompt and effective enforcement actions when warranted.
- 4. Providing excellent customer service.
  - Implementing and developing new coordination and collaboration agreements with NCUA, private share insurance providers, and other applicable state regulators regarding supervisory activities performed in credit unions and information exchange.
  - Working effectively with the NCUA, private share insurance providers, and other state regulators to identify and address risks and emerging issues.
- 5. Transparent such that agency actions can be understood by any Texan.
  - Complying with the examination requirements of 7 TAC Section 97.105.
  - Implementing and developing new coordination and collaboration agreements with NCUA.

private share insurance providers, and other applicable state regulators regarding supervisory activities performed in credit unions and information exchange.

• Adhering to performance measures.

# DESCRIBE ANY OTHER CONSIDERATIONS RELEVANT TO YOUR GOAL OR ACTION ITEM

- 1. The Department fosters safe and sound credit union practices through regular risk-focused examinations, publication of guidances and policies, ongoing communications with credit union officials, and the review of applications submitted by credit unions to expand activities. When appropriate, the Department has a range of informal and formal enforcement options available to resolve safety and soundness problems identified at these institutions. The Department also devotes resources to administering off-site monitoring programs and to enhance its ability to timely identify emerging safety and soundness issues and trends.
- 2. Should a situation arise where a noncompliant business is discovered, the Department has statutory authority to take enforcement action against the entity. Disputes are investigated by staff and every attempt is made to bring about a fair resolution. State leadership and other interested parties are routinely provided information about credit unions, and the associated laws, rules, policies, and practices of the Department.
- 3. This strategic plan reaffirms the Department's mission to ensure that credit unions operate in a safe and sound manner, provide fair access to credit union services, treat members fairly, and comply with applicable laws and rules. The plan presents a vision in which the Department is a preeminent agency that adds value through proactive and risk-based supervision, is sought after as a source of knowledge and expertise, and promotes a vibrant and diverse credit union system that benefits the Texas economy. To succeed in that mission and achieve that vision, the Department commits itself to the core values of integrity, expertise, collaboration, and independence—values that always have been the bedrock of the Department's culture.
- 4. The Department works closely with federal and other state regulators to provide credit unions seamless supervision, minimal disruption and costs, and effective use of resources. The Department continues its joint examination program entered into with the National Credit Union Administration (NCUA) in 2003. The joint examination results in more efficient and less burdensome examinations for credit unions.

## AGENCY OPERATIONAL GOAL AND ACTION PLAN

*Goal 2.* To provide a flexible regulatory framework that enables credit unions to provide a full competitive array of financial services.

## SPECIFIC ACTION ITEMS TO ACHIEVE YOUR GOAL

- 1. Each Commission rule is current, clearly written, and necessary for an effective supervisory process.
- 2. The Department supports credit union efforts to remain competitive, consistent with safety and soundness.
- 3. Credit union application procedures are efficient and consistent with safety and soundness.

# DESCRIBE HOW YOUR GOAL OR ACTION ITEMS SUPPORTS EACH STATEWIDE OBJECTIVE

1. Accountable to tax and fee payers of Texas.

- Ensuring no state funds are spent on Department operations; as a self-directed, semiindependent agency, the Department's revenue is derived from state chartered credit unions fees and assessments.
- Being a prudent steward of its financial resources.

- Providing transparency through its reporting.
- Drafting, amending, and implementing rules to fulfill Legislative directives and to ensure relevance to current conditions.
- Implementing rulemaking through successful collaboration and consultation with interested parties.
- Communicating attributes of the state charter within and outside the Department.
- Implementing and maintaining processes for prompt screening of applications.
- 2. Efficient such that maximum results are produced with a minimum waste of taxpayer funds, including through the elimination of redundant and non-core functions.
  - Drafting, amending, and implementing rules to fulfill Legislative directives and to ensure relevance to current conditions.
  - Developing and modernizing attributes of the credit union charter and the role and status of the industry.
  - Enhancing communication with NCUA and other state regulators to facilitate better coordination on issues affecting credit unions.
  - Implementing and maintaining processes for prompt screening of applications.
  - Enhancing existing technology solutions that support effective application operations.
- 3. Effective in successfully fulfilling core functions, measuring success in achieving performance measures and implementing plans to continuously improve.
  - Meet or exceed performance measures.
  - Conducting the mandatory rule review in accordance with Commission's approved plan.
  - Implementing and maintaining processes for prompt screening of applications.
  - Establishing policies and procedures that provide clear and comprehensive guidance.
  - Enhancing existing technology solutions that support effective application operations.

4. Providing excellent customer service.

- Accessible staff who are a resource for consumers and the regulated industry.
- Supporting the continued recognition of the attributes of the state credit union charter through appropriate opinions and rules.
- Investigate and resolve customer complaints in a timely manner.
- Establishing policies and procedures that provide clear and comprehensive guidance.
- Enhancing existing technology solutions that support effective application operations.
- Providing useful information for consumers and the regulated industry on the Department's website.
- 5. Transparent such that agency actions can be understood by any Texan.
  - Adhering to performance measures.
  - Implementing rulemaking through successful collaboration and consultation with interested parties.
  - Communicating attributes of the state charter within and outside the Department.
  - Establishing policies and procedures that provide clear and comprehensive guidance.

# DESCRIBE ANY OTHER CONSIDERATIONS RELEVANT TO YOUR GOAL OR ACTION ITEM

1. The Department places a high priority on its responsiveness to inquiries, requests, and complaints from citizens, members, credit unions, public officials, and other state and federal governmental entities. Pursuant to statute, the Department accepts complaints against credit unions and reviews them for potential violations of applicable laws or rules. When the Department receives complaints, credit unions are contacted and given an opportunity to respond to a member's concern or inquiry. Member complaints have increased over the last five years and the Department expects

this trend to continue. In fiscal year 2012, the Department received 174 complaints, rising to 223 in 2013, 230 in 2014, 253 in 2015, 265 in 2016, and 280 in 2017. Through its response to these complaints and inquiries, the Department attempts to help members better understand their rights and responsibilities under applicable laws and regulations. The Department monitors the level of satisfaction with its responses to member complaints and inquiries.

- 2. The Department works closely with federal and other state regulators to provide credit unions seamless supervision, minimal disruption and costs, and effective use of resources. The Department continues its joint examination program entered into with the National Credit Union Administration in 2003. The joint examination results in more efficient and less burdensome examinations for credit unions.
- 3. The Department cooperates with the Financial Crimes Enforcement Network ("FinCEN") and numerous other federal agencies to monitor compliance with the BSA/AML and USA Patriot Act and other laws governing credit unions. The rise in popularity of virtual or digital currencies has the attention of federal and state regulators for many reasons including money-laundering concerns. FinCEN issued guidance which labels certain digital currency entities as money transmitters and requires them to implement AML programs.

### AGENCY OPERATIONAL GOAL AND ACTION PLAN

Goal 3. To safeguard the interest of credit union members.

### SPECIFIC ACTION ITEMS TO ACHIEVE YOUR GOAL

- 1. All credit union members have reasonable access to credit union services and are treated fairly and lawfully.
- 2. Credit unions are involved in providing financial services in underserved communities within this State.

# DESCRIBE HOW YOUR GOAL OR ACTION ITEMS SUPPORTS EACH STATEWIDE OBJECTIVE

- 1. Accountable to tax and fee payers of Texas.
  - Ensuring no state funds are spent on Department operations; as a self-directed, semiindependent agency, the Department's revenue is derived from state chartered credit unions fees and assessments.
  - Being a prudent steward of its financial resources.
  - Providing transparency through its reporting.
  - Drafting, amending, and implementing rules to fulfill Legislative directives and to ensure relevance to current conditions.
  - Reinforcing the importance of fair and honest treatment of credit union members through appropriate supervisory and enforcement action.
  - Supporting the efforts of credit unions to expand their fields of membership to included underserved and low-income communities.
- 2. Efficient such that maximum results are produced with a minimum waste of taxpayer funds, including through the elimination of redundant and non-core functions.
  - Supporting the efforts of credit unions to expand their fields of membership to included underserved and low-income communities.
- 3. Effective in successfully fulfilling core functions, measuring success in achieving performance measures and implementing plans to continuously improve.
  - Strengthening role in addressing member privacy, information security, and identity theft.
  - Supporting the efforts of credit unions to expand their fields of membership to included underserved and low-income communities.

4. Providing excellent customer service.

- Strengthening role in addressing member privacy, information security, and identity theft.
- Supporting the efforts of credit unions to expand their fields of membership to included underserved and low-income communities.
- 5. Transparent such that agency actions can be understood by any Texan.
  - Reinforcing the importance of fair and honest treatment of credit union members through appropriate supervisory and enforcement action.

# DESCRIBE ANY OTHER CONSIDERATIONS RELEVANT TO YOUR GOAL OR ACTION ITEM

- 1. Through its response to the complaints and inquiries, the Department attempts to help members better understand their rights and responsibilities under applicable laws and regulations. The Department monitors the level of satisfaction with its responses to member complaints and inquiries.
- 2. The National Association of State Credit Union Supervisors ("NASCUS") has established accreditation standards for credit union supervision and regulation. Patterned after university accreditation, the accreditation process requires a comprehensive review of all factors needed to have a fully functional regulatory agency. The Department has been continuously accredited by NASCUS since 1996. Every year, the accreditation committee of NASCUS requires updated information to maintain accredited status; a full-scale re-accreditation occurs on-site every five years, which for the Department will occur in 2016. Accreditation provides the Department with national recognition among its peers and professional respect from the institutions it regulates.

### AGENCY OPERATIONAL GOAL AND ACTION PLAN

Goal 4. To develop a professional and motivated staff that provides quality service to the citizens of Texas and supports achievement of the Department's statutory mission.

#### SPECIFIC ACTION ITEMS TO ACHIEVE YOUR GOAL

- 1. The Department maintains a competent, highly motivated, and diverse workforce in a fair and inclusive work environment.
- 2. The Department is an efficient, effective, and ethical organization.
- 3. The Department's resource decisions and operations reflect sound financial, security, and risk management principles.

# DESCRIBE HOW YOUR GOAL OR ACTION ITEMS SUPPORTS EACH STATEWIDE OBJECTIVE

1. Accountable to tax and fee payers of Texas.

- Ensuring no state funds are spent on Department operations; as a self-directed, semi-independent agency, the Department's revenue is derived from state chartered credit unions fees and assessments.
- Being a prudent steward of its financial resources.
- Providing transparency through its reporting.
- Drafting, amending, and implementing rules to fulfill Legislative directives and to ensure relevance to current conditions.
- Drafting, amending, and implementing rules to fulfill Legislative directives and to ensure relevance to current conditions.
- Maintaining a comprehensive Equal Employment and Workforce Diversity Plan.
- Ensuring compliance with laws, rules, and stewardship of its resources through program evaluations and a quality management framework.

- Ensuring compliance with the rules, policies and procedures for ethical conduct by its employees.
- Achieving reliable, accurate and timely financial resources management information.
- 2. Efficient such that maximum results are produced with a minimum waste of taxpayer funds, including through the elimination of redundant and non-core functions.
  - Executing an aggressive recruiting and comprehensive training strategy for new entry-level examiners.
  - Developing proactive initiatives focused on the retention of employees, including addressing pay differentials for examiners to bring base pay more in line with the examiner pay at other regulatory agencies, maintaining staffing to achieve the ideal level of 160 exam days for each examiner, mentoring, employee feedback, incentives, and recognition programs.
  - Creating a leadership development program to support and enhance management succession.
  - Ensuring compliance with laws, rules, and stewardship of its resources through program evaluations and a quality management framework.
  - Ensuring reliable, secure, modern information technology systems are in place in support of an environment that meets the Department's mission, goals, and objectives.
  - Achieving reliable, accurate and timely financial resources management information.
  - Implementing security controls to mitigate risk and to protect confidential information.
  - Improving contingency planning for business continuity, including information technology recovery, compliance with Homeland Security requirements, and crisis management strategies.
- 3. Effective in successfully fulfilling core functions, measuring success in achieving performance measures and implementing plans to continuously improve.
  - Executing an aggressive recruiting and comprehensive training strategy for new entry-level examiners.
  - Developing proactive initiatives focused on the retention of employees, including addressing pay differentials for examiners to bring base pay more in line with the examiner pay at other regulatory agencies, maintaining staffing to achieve the ideal level of 160 exam days for each examiner, mentoring, employee feedback, incentives, and recognition programs.
  - Creating a leadership development program to support and enhance management succession.
  - Maintaining a comprehensive Equal Employment and Workforce Diversity Plan.
  - Ensuring compliance with laws, rules, and stewardship of its resources through program evaluations and a quality management framework.
  - Ensuring compliance with the rules, policies and procedures for ethical conduct by its employees.
  - Ensuring reliable, secure, modern information technology systems are in place in support of an environment that meets the Department's mission, goals, and objectives.
  - Leveraging technology, with particular focus on information management initiatives, such as records and knowledge management.
  - Implementing security controls to mitigate risk and to protect confidential information.
  - Improving contingency planning for business continuity, including information technology recovery, compliance with Homeland Security requirements, and crisis management strategies.
  - Achieving reliable, accurate and timely financial resources management information.
- 4. Providing excellent customer service.
  - Developing proactive initiatives focused on the retention of employees, including addressing pay differentials for examiners to bring base pay more in line with the examiner pay at other regulatory agencies, maintaining staffing to achieve the ideal level of 160 exam days for each examiner, mentoring, employee feedback, incentives, and recognition programs.

- Ensuring compliance with laws, rules, and stewardship of its resources through program evaluations and a quality management framework.
- Ensuring compliance with the rules, policies and procedures for ethical conduct by its employees.
- Ensuring reliable, secure, modern information technology systems are in place in support of an environment that meets the Department's mission, goals, and objectives.
- Achieving reliable, accurate and timely financial resources management information.

5. Transparent such that agency actions can be understood by any Texan.

- Developing proactive initiatives focused on the retention of employees, including addressing pay differentials for examiners to bring base pay more in line with the examiner pay at other regulatory agencies, maintaining staffing to achieve the ideal level of 160 exam days for each examiner, mentoring, employee feedback, incentives, and recognition programs.
- Maintaining a comprehensive Equal Employment and Workforce Diversity Plan.
- Ensuring compliance with laws, rules, and stewardship of its resources through program evaluations and a quality management framework.
- Ensuring compliance with the rules, policies and procedures for ethical conduct by its employees.
- Achieving reliable, accurate and timely financial resources management information.

# DESCRIBE ANY OTHER CONSIDERATIONS RELEVANT TO YOUR GOAL OR ACTION ITEM

- 1. The Commission sets the spending limits of the Department. As a SDSI agency, the Department continues to be self-funding and no General Revenue Funds are used to support its operation.
- 2. Financial crimes consist of several broad categories such as fraud, money laundering, and corruption with many subcategories such as terrorist financing, identity theft, kickbacks, and bribery. The United States government has powerful tools to pursue financial criminals and the framework to force credit unions into compliance with a wide range of laws, such as the Bank Secrecy Act/Anti-Money Laundering and USA Patriot Acts. Financial crimes are a threat for credit unions and the Department alike. Having a knowledgeable and trained staff that understands the risks and how they can be managed is essential.
- 3. No single factor is more critical to the Department's ability to accomplish its mission and to its success than its staff. Acquiring, developing, and retaining a competent workforce will continue to be one of the Department's top priorities and is one of its four strategic goals. At the same time, and similar to the rest of state government, significant internal and external factors affect the Department's current and future workforce, challenging the Department's ability to ensure that the its staff is well trained, skilled, and capable of meeting the needs of the rapidly changing and growing complex industry.
- 4. The Department operates and maintains its only office in Austin. Agency examiners work from their residences, located primarily in the Dallas/Fort Worth and Houston metropolitan areas. Because credit unions are located throughout the state, examiners are required to travel extensively in examining credit unions with overnight travel of 40-55 percent. Given the amount of travel required, stationing field staff in these two metropolitan areas helps to minimize travel-related costs. The Department is solely responsible for the upkeep and maintenance of the Credit Union Department Building. Each year during the budgeting process, the Commission reviews and approves maintenance, major repairs, and long-term improvements.

#### **REDUNDANCIES AND IMPEDIMENTS**

The agency does not have any services, state statutes, and state rules or regulations applicable to the agency that may result in barriers to the economic prosperity of Texans or make the agency less effective and efficient in achieving its core mission and merit additional executive and legislative review nor does the agency have any state services, state laws, and state regulations administered by the agency that are redundant, distract from the core mission of the agency, and/or produce workload costs for agency staff or regulated entities that may exceed the initial time, cost, or effort assumptions that existed when the law or regulation was implemented.

The statutes pertaining to the operation of the Department and the regulation and supervision of Texas statechartered credit unions are considered comprehensive and current, and correctly delineate the Department's responsibilities and authorities. Furthermore, the Commission has the means by which to propose necessary statutory changes to the Legislature. TEX. FIN. CODE §§15.103 and 15.405, require the Department to periodically study the credit union statutes of the state and report its legislative recommendations to the Legislature for consideration. Notwithstanding these requirements, the Department continually reviews State of Texas statutes pertaining to credit union operations. The Commissioner, with the approval of the Commission, reports the recommendations of the Department as necessary to the Legislature for its consideration (TEX. FIN. CODE §15.405).

REDUNDANCIES AND IMPEDIMENTS (REPEAT SECTION AS NECESSARY FOR EACH IDENTIFIED REDUNDANCY AND IMPEDIMENT)		
SERVICE, STATUTE, RULE, OR REGULATION (PROVIDE SPECIFIC CITATION IF APPLICABLE)	NONE	
DESCRIBE WHY THE SERVICE, STATUTE, RULE, OR REGULATION IS RESULTING IN INEFFICIENT OR INEFFECTIVE AGENCY OPERATIONS	N/A	
PROVIDE AGENCY RECOMMENDATION FOR MODIFICATION OR ELIMINATION	N/A	
DESCRIBE THE ESTIMATED COST SAVINGS OR OTHER BENEFIT ASSOCIATED WITH RECOMMENDED CHANGE	N/A	
NATURAL DISASTER-RELATED REDUNDANCIES AND IMPEDIMENTS (IF APPLICABLE)		
SERVICE, STATUTE, RULE, OR REGULATION (PROVIDE SPECIFIC CITATION IF APPLICABLE)	NONE	
DESCRIBE WHY THE SERVICE, STATUTE, RULE, OR REGULATION IS RESULTING IN INEFFICIENT OR INEFFECTIVE AGENCY OPERATIONS	N/A	
PROVIDE AGENCY RECOMMENDATION FOR MODIFICATION OR ELIMINATION	N/A	
DESCRIBE THE ESTIMATED COST SAVINGS OR OTHER BENEFIT ASSOCIATED WITH RECOMMENDED CHANGE	N/A	

#### SCHEDULE A: BUDGET STRUCTURE

#### AGENCY BUDGET STRUCTURE ELEMENTS (GOALS, STRATEGIES, MEASURES AND MEASURE DEFINITIONS) FOR THE 2020–21 BIENNIUM

#### AGENCY NAME:

Credit Union Department

ELEMENT Identify the current Goal, Strategy, Measure or Measure Definition.	REQUESTED CHANGE	JUSTIFI- CATION FOR REQUESTED CHANGE	LBB OR OOG APPR'D	LBB / OOG COM- MENT	STATUS
<ul> <li>Goal 1: A Safe and Sound Credit Union Industry</li> <li>Strategy: Examine Credit Union Operations</li> <li>Outcome Measure: Percentage of Credit Unions Receiving Regular</li> <li>Examination Annually</li> </ul>	None	None	NA		NA
Goal 1: A Safe and Sound Credit Union Industry <i>Strategy: Examine Credit Union Operations</i> Outcome Measure: Percentage of Credit Unions With Composite CAMELS Ratings of 1 or 2	None	None	NA		NA
<ul> <li>Goal 1: A Safe and Sound Credit Union Industry Strategy: Examine Credit Union Operations</li> <li>Outcome Measure: Percentage of Assets Held in Credit Unions With Composite CAMELS Ratings of 1 or 2</li> </ul>	None	None	NA		NA
Goal 1: A Safe and Sound Credit Union Industry <i>Strategy: Examine Credit Union Operations</i> Output Measure: Number of Regular Examinations Performed	None	None	NA		NA
Goal 1: A Safe and Sound Credit Union Industry <i>Strategy: Examine Credit Union Operations</i> Explanatory Measure: Number of State-Chartered Credit Unions	None	None	NA		NA
<ul> <li>Goal 1: A Safe and Sound Credit Union Industry <i>Strategy: Examine Credit Union Operations</i> Outcome Measure: Percentage of Complete Applications Approved or Denied Within 60 Days     </li> </ul>	None	None	NA		NA

#### SCHEDULE A: BUDGET STRUCTURE

#### AGENCY BUDGET STRUCTURE ELEMENTS (GOALS, STRATEGIES, MEASURES AND MEASURE DEFINITIONS) FOR THE 2020-21 BIENNIUM

Goal 2: A Flexible Regulatory Framework <i>Strategy: Process, Investigate and Evaluate Applications</i> Output Measure: Number of Applications Processed	None	None	NA	NA
Goal 2: A Flexible Regulatory Framework <i>Strategy: Provide Oversight of Department Operations</i> Outcome Measure: Percentage of Rule Changes provided to Credit Unions Within 60 Days After Adoption	None	None	NA	NA
Goal 3: Protect Credit Union Member Interests <i>Strategy: Examine Credit Union Operations</i> Explanatory Measure: Percentage of Credit Unions Providing Services to Low Income or Underserved Populations	None	None	NA	NA

#### SCHEDULE B. PERFORMANCE MEASURES

#### Outcome Measure: Percentage of Credit Unions Receiving Regular Examination Annually

#### Definition

The number of credit unions examined within an examination cycle of no more than 18 months during the fiscal year, expressed as a ratio of the total number of state-chartered credit unions for same period.

#### **Purpose/Importance**

This measure monitors the Department's performance in meeting the Commission's mandate and 7 TEX. ADMIN. CODE §97.105.

#### Source/Collection of Data

Supporting information regarding each examination is tracked in the Department's internal database.

#### Method of Calculation

Divide the number of credit unions examined during the reporting period by the total number of credit unions for the same period.

Data Limitations	<b>Calculation Type</b>
None	Noncumulative
New Measure No	<b>Target Attainment:</b> 80.0% annual

#### **Outcome Measure: Percentage of Credit Unions with Composite CAMELS Ratings of 1 or 2**

#### Definition

The number of credit unions with composite CAMELS rating of 1 or 2 during the applicable period based upon a rating system, expressed as a percentage of the total number of credit unions regulated for the same period.

#### **Purpose/Importance**

Measures the financial health of the Texas state-chartered credit unions. Ties directly to a statewide regulatory benchmark.

#### Source/Collection of Data

Supporting information regarding each examination is tracked in the Department's internal database.

#### Method of Calculation

Divide the number of credit unions assigned a composite CAMELS rating of 1 or 2 by the total number of credit unions for the same reporting period.

#### **Data Limitations**

Limited control over events that could lead a credit union to receiving a lower CAMELS rating.

Calculation Type Noncumulative

#### SCHEDULE B. PERFORMANCE MEASURES

**New Measure** No **Target Attainment:** Informational

# **Outcome Measure: Percentage of Assets Held in Credit Unions with Composite CAMELS Ratings of 1 or 2**

#### Definition

The consolidated total assets of credit unions with composite CAMELS rating of 1 or 2 as reported in the designated quarterly call report based upon a rating system, expressed as a percentage of the consolidated total assets of all credit unions regulated for the same period.

#### **Purpose/Importance**

This informational measure indicates the financial health of the Texas chartered credit union industry. Ties directly to a statewide regulatory benchmark.

#### Source/Collection of Data

Quarterly financial and statistical Call Report data filed with the Department by each credit union.

#### **Method of Calculation**

Divide the consolidated total assets of credit unions assigned a composite CAMELS rating of 1 or 2 by the consolidated total assets of all credit unions for the same reporting period.

#### **Data Limitations**

Limited control over events that could lead a credit union to receiving a lower CAMELS rating.

**Calculation Type** Noncumulative

New Measure No

**Target Attainment:** Informational

#### Output Measure: Number of Regular Examinations Performed

#### Definition

The number of regular examinations the Department performs during the reporting period.

#### **Purpose/Importance**

The measure indicates whether the Department is meeting the frequency of examination requirements of 7 TEX. ADMIN. CODE §97.105.

#### Source/Collection of Data

Supporting information regarding each examination is tracked in the Department's internal database.

#### **Method of Calculation**

Count the regular, full-scope or limited-scope examinations, in which the report of examination was received for processing during the period being measured.

#### SCHEDULE B. PERFORMANCE MEASURES

#### **Data Limitations**

High turnover of trained examiners has a negative impact.

#### **New Measure** No

#### Explanatory Measure: Number of State-Chartered Credit Unions

#### Definition

The number of active Texas state-chartered credit unions under the Department's jurisdiction during the reporting period, less the number of credit unions in the process of being liquidated.

#### **Purpose/Importance**

This explanatory measure is an indicator of the extent of the Department's responsibility over the safe and sound regulation of state-chartered credit unions.

#### Source/Collection of Data

The Department maintains a database which tracks all active, liquidating, and cancelled state credit union charters.

#### **Method of Calculation**

Count the total number of active state-chartered credit unions under the supervision of the Department from the database, less any being liquidated.

#### **Data Limitations**

No control over number of new charter requests, mergers, or conversions.

**New Measure** 

No

Calculation Type Noncumulative

**Target Attainment:** Informational

#### **Output Measure:** Percentage of Complete Applications Approved/Denied within 60 days

#### Definition

The number of complete applications approved or denied not later than the 60<sup>th</sup> day after the date notice of the applications are published, or after the date the applications are received if notice is not required to be published, expressed as a percentage of all applications approved or denied for the same period. Applications include applications for mergers, for charter conversions (federal to state, state to federal, state credit union to mutual savings associations, and mutual savings associations to state credit unions), for insurance conversions, and for amendments to bylaws and articles of incorporation. If an application is protested, it is not considered complete until responses from all parties have been received.

#### **Purpose/Importance**

Finance Code §122.005 requires the Commissioner to approve or disapprove applications not later

**Target Attainment:** Informational

#### SCHEDULE B. PERFORMANCE MEASURES

than the 60<sup>th</sup> day after the date notice of the application is published, or after the date the application is received if the notice is not required to be published.

#### **Source/Collection of Data**

Supporting information regarding each application is tracked in the Department's internal database.

#### **Method of Calculation**

Divide the number of complete applications approved or denied not later than the 60<sup>th</sup> day after the date notice of the application is published, or after the date the application is received if the notice is not required to be published, whichever is later, by the total number of applications approved or denied during the same reporting period.

Data Limitations	<b>Calculation Type</b>
Protests	Noncumulative
New Measure No	<b>Target Attainment:</b> 100%

#### **Output Measure:** Number of Applications Processed

#### Definition

The number of complete applications approved or denied during the reporting period. Applications include applications for mergers, for charter conversions (federal to state, state to federal, state credit union to mutual savings associations, and mutual savings associations to state credit unions), for insurance conversions, and for amendments to bylaws and articles of incorporation.

#### **Purpose/Importance**

This measure is used as the denominator to calculate the outcome measure percentage of complete applications approved or denied within 60 days.

#### Source/Collection of Data

Supporting information regarding each application is tracked in the Department's internal database.

#### Method of Calculation

Total the number of applications processed for the reporting period.

#### **Data Limitations**

No control over the number of applications received

New Measure No Calculation Type Cumulative

**Target Attainment:** Informational

Outcome Measure: Percentage of Rule Changes Provided to Credit Unions Within 60 Days After Adoption

#### SCHEDULE B. PERFORMANCE MEASURES

#### Definition

The number of new, amended, and readopted rules that are mailed out within 60 days of their final adoption by the Commission.

#### **Purpose/Importance**

The measure indicates how quickly credit unions are informed of changes affecting their operations or Department operations.

#### Source/Collection of Data

The date a new, amended, or readopted rule is adopted, as well as the date the letter of transmittal for the Texas Laws and Regulations for Credit Unions are sent out to credit unions, is entered into a database and tracked accordingly.

#### **Method of Calculation**

Divide the number of rule changes provided to credit unions within 60 days of the effective date of their adoption by the number of rule changes adopted during the same reporting period.

Data Limitations	<b>Calculation Type</b>
None	Noncumulative
<b>New Measure</b>	<b>Target Attainment:</b>
No	100%

**Explanatory Measure: Percentage of Credit Unions Providing Services to Low Income or Underserved Populations** 

#### Definition

Number of credit unions with federal low-income designations as a percentage of the number of state chartered credit unions for the same reporting period.

#### **Purpose/Importance**

This measure indicates the number of credit unions that primarily serve Texas citizens that are close to the national poverty level, as well as citizens that live in areas with limited access to financial institutions.

#### **Source/Collection of Data**

Low-income approval letters from the National Credit Union Administration are retained in a file. The Department also maintains an excel spreadsheet of the credit unions that have received a federal low-income designation.

#### Method of Calculation

Divide the number of state-chartered credit unions that are approved by the National Credit Union Administration for a low-income designation pursuant to Part 705.3(a) of the National Credit Union Administration's Rules and Regulation by the total number of state-chartered credit unions for the same reporting period.

# PART 2. SUPPLEMENTAL ELEMENTS SCHEDULE B. PERFORMANCE MEASURES

#### **Data Limitations**

No control over how many credit unions will apply for designation.

#### **New Measure**

No

**Calculation Type** Noncumulative

**Target Attainment:** Informational

# PART 2. SUPPLEMENTAL ELEMENTS SCHEDULE C. HISTORICALLY UNDERUTILIZED BUSINESS PLAN

# HUB 7.07 REPORT CREDIT UNION DEPARTMENT 469 INTERNAL ASSESSMENT ON UTILIZATION OF HUBS POLICY COMPLIANCE REPORT

#### Demonstrating Compliance with HUB Purchasing Requirements

The Department consistently contacts Historically Underutilized Businesses ("HUBs") for bids on spot purchases and small dollar amount procurements. Due to budget constraints, products and services are obtained from the lowest bidder. In addition to its HUB policy, the Department has a HUB Diversity Plan to ensure that our HUB purchases represent as many different minority and women-owned businesses as possible.

Although the Department has limited opportunities to award contracts, it makes every effort to foster meaningful and substantive inclusion of HUBS in the Department's procurement processes. In addition, the Department makes every effort to ensure that it makes its purchases from a diverse group within the HUBs.

The Department has adopted a policy to achieve the proportional HUB expenditure targets established by the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts and monitors its progress toward achieving these goals. The Department reviews this policy annually and the Department has a designated HUB coordinator, its Staff Services Officer. The Department's HUB coordinator has attended training on HUB requirements.

The Department's Agency Strategic Plan for 2017-2021 states the Department's policy to achieve the proportional HUB expenditure targets established by the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. **During fiscal year 2016 and fiscal year 2017, the Department has exceeded its HUB targets in the various categories.** 

The total amount of expenditures with HUBs for fiscal year 2017 was \$56,867 and the total amount of non-HUB expenditures was \$58,466. In fiscal year 2016, the total amount of expenditures for HUBs was \$104,273 and the total amount of non-HUB expenditures was \$56,981.

Attached is a copy of the Department's HUB Consolidated Agency Report for fiscal year 2016 and fiscal year 2017. Both reports show that the Department exceeded its HUB goals.

The Department only purchases from two procurement categories: other services and commodity purchasing. During fiscal year 2016, the Department's HUB purchases for other services were 67 percent, over the stated goal of 26.0 percent and the Department's HUB commodity purchases were 56 percent, over the stated goal of 21.1 percent. During fiscal year 2017, the Department's HUB purchases for other services were 47.8 percent, over the stated goal of 26.0 percent and the Department's HUB commodity purchases for other services were 53.1 percent, over the stated goal of 21.1 percent.

### SCHEDULE C. HISTORICALLY UNDERUTILIZED BUSINESS PLAN

# **HUB PARTICIPATION**

	FY16	FY17
Total Agency Expenditure	\$161,254	\$115,333
Total Dollar Amount Spent with HUBs	\$104,273	\$56,867
Percent of TotalExpenditure Spentwith HUBs	64.66%	49.31%
Women	\$36,440	\$36,216
Black	\$9,682	\$2,156
Hispanic	\$277	10,000
Asian-Pacific	\$56,844	\$8,494
Native-American	\$1,030	0

#### Plans to Maintain Compliance

The Department is strongly committed to using HUBs for purchases in future years to maintain its excellent compliance record. The Department will continue to include HUB policies, goals, and programs in its strategic plan. The Department will continue to contact HUBS for bids on spot purchases and small dollar amount procurements. The Department will continue to make a good faith effort to utilize HUBs in contracts for construction, services (including professional and consulting services) and commodities purchases bin accordance with 34 TAC §20.13. The Department will continue to meet state reporting requirements and optional reporting requirements for self-directed and semi-independent agencies, such as this reporting requirement. The Department annually updates its HUB policy and will continue to maintain its HUB Diversity Plan to ensure that our HUB purchases represent as many different minority and women-owned businesses as possible.

Although the Department has limited opportunities to award contracts, the Department will continue to make every effort to foster meaningful and substantive inclusion of HUBS in the Department's procurement processes.

### SCHEDULES D. STATEWIDE CAPITAL PLANNING AND E. HHS STRATEGIC PLANNING

# SCHEDULE D: STATEWIDE CAPITAL PLANNING

## NOT APPLICABLE

# SCHEDULE E: HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES STRATEGIC PLANNING

## NOT APPLICABLE

# SCHEDULES F. AGENCY WORKFORCE PLAN AND THE TEXAS WORKFORCE SYSTEM STRATEGIC PLAN



# Credit Union Department Fiscal Year 2019-2020 Workforce Plan

#### I. Agency Overview

The Department was established as a separate agency in 1969 to supervise and regulate state chartered unions. This is accomplished through annual examinations of each credit union to ensure enforcement of laws, rules, bylaws, and sound business practices, imposing appropriate administrative sanctions, diligent monitoring between examinations, and aggressive remedial efforts when needed.

The administrative office of the agency is domiciled in Austin, but field examiners are based in Dallas/Fort Worth and Houston. The largest percentage of employees are directly associated with the examination process including field examiners, a Director of Examination Support Activities, an executive assistant and the Deputy Commissioner. The remaining positions include the Commissioner, Director of Information Technology, Network Specialist and supporting staff in Austin (See Appendix B: CUD Organizational Chart).

The Department currently is authorized for 29.5 full time equivalents (FTEs) and will consider expanding the workforce as the complexity and assets of regulated credit unions increases. Operating fees paid by the credit unions cover all agency expenses, including payments to other state agencies, such as the Office of Attorney General, for services performed.

#### A. Agency Mission

The mission of the Credit Union Department is to safeguard the public interest, protect the interests of credit union members and promote public confidence in credit unions industry in accordance with TEX. FIN. CODE §15.102.

# SCHEDULES F. AGENCY WORKFORCE PLAN AND THE TEXAS WORKFORCE SYSTEM STRATEGIC PLAN

#### **B.** Strategic Goals and Objectives

The Texas Credit Union Department has three main goals

Goal A	EFFECTIVE SUPERVISION AND REGULATION		
Objective	To effectively supervise and regulate state-chartered credit unions through		
	enforcement of safety and soundness standards and compliance with the Texas		
	Finance Code, and in a manner that balances the interest of the membership and the		
	need for public confidence in the credit union system.		
	• Examine all credit unions within 18 months of the previous examination		
	• Take appropriate enforcement action in problem credit unions		
Strategies	• Perform remedial examinations when necessary		
	Respond promptly to member complaints		
	Respond promptly to requests for interpretations or opinions		
	Process applications in a timely manner		

Goal B	INSURE SAFETY AND SOUNDNESS	
Objective	Through interaction with the Credit Union Commission and the Legislature,	
	recommend statutory and rule changes to ensure that credit unions operate in a safe	
	and sound manner in a competitive and ever-changing financial services industry.	
	Promulgate new and amended rules	
Strategies	Recommend statutory changes to the Legislature	
	Provide oversight of departmental operations	

Goal C	PROCUREMENT USING HISTORICALLY UNDERUTILIZED BUSINESSES		
Objective	To establish and carry out policies governing purchasing and public works contracting		
	which foster meaningful and substantive inclusion of historically underutilized		
	businesses.		
	Contact HUB contractors for bid proposals		
Strategies	Purchase from state contracted HUB providers		

#### C. Anticipated Changes in Strategies

The agency does not anticipate major changes to its business or workforce strategies. Offsetting the decline in the number of state-chartered credit unions is the increase in total assets of credit unions. The current growth in assets of state chartered credit unions has come primarily from expansion of field of membership and services offered by existing credit unions, and federal credit unions converting to a state charter.

Using a risk-focused examination process, examiners give additional attention to the areas of operation that have been identified in a risk assessment. Because of the disparity in the size and complexity of credit unions, examiners remain generalists in terms of their expertise. However, examiners exhibiting an interest in or

# SCHEDULES F. AGENCY WORKFORCE PLAN AND THE TEXAS WORKFORCE SYSTEM STRATEGIC PLAN

special abilities in a particular discipline (lending, investments, internal controls, etc.) will be provided with more specific training in that discipline. Due to the increased use of information technology in credit union operations and the critical need for adequate back up and security for these systems, the Department anticipates increasing the scope of the information technology examination of credit unions each year. This may be accomplished by requiring credit unions to perform a third-party information technology audits which the examiners will review and/or hiring qualified third-parties to perform specific functions.

#### II. Current Workforce Profile

#### A. Critical Workforce Skills

The agency has a core group of qualified employees at the present time. The examiners, which represent the majority of employees, must have major course work in accounting, finance, economics, business administration or a job-related field with a minimum of six hours, nine preferred, in accounting (including basic and intermediate accounting). Other skills that are important to the agency's ability to perform our business function include:

- Financial statement analysis
- Investment analysis
- Proficient oral and written communication
- Investigative

The support staff must also possess skills that are critical to the operation of the agency. These skills include:

•

- Database development and maintenance
- Customer service

• Document processing

• Internal control analysis

Information technology analysis

• Accounting/Payroll

• Loan analysis

#### **B.** Workforce Demographics

The following charts profile the agency's workforce as of August 31, 2017. The agency is authorized 29.5 FTEs. The CUD workforce is comprised of 58.6 percent males and 41.4 percent females. Approximately two-thirds, or 66 percent, of the employees are over the age of 40. The average tenure of an agency employee is 8.8 years; the average tenure of the nineteen (19) field examiners is 7.6 years. Eight (8) examiners have been with the Department less than two years.

The ethnic breakdown of the workforce is 55 percent Anglo, 21 percent African-American, 14 percent Hispanic and 10 percent Other. The 2010 Census showed a Texas population that was 45.3 percent Anglo, 11.8 percent African-American, 37.6 percent Hispanic, and 4.6 percent Other. Most census projections predict a rising Hispanic population in the state of Texas over the next 40 years.

#### C. Employee Turnover

Employee turnover is experienced by every business entity or governmental agency. It is costly to continually train new employees, diminishes efficiency of the staff, and adversely affects employee morale. The Credit Union Department experienced very high examiner turnover rates during the late 1990s, attributable to non-

# SCHEDULES F. AGENCY WORKFORCE PLAN AND THE TEXAS WORKFORCE SYSTEM STRATEGIC PLAN

competitive salaries, extensive travel requirements, and the nature of the work as a regulatory agency. Management and support staff positions remained constant during the same period. Examiners with experience in excess of 2-3 years become attractive to credit unions due to their wide diversity of experiences, and familiarity with credit union laws and regulations. Experienced examiners were also attracted to the National Credit Union Administration (NCUA), the federal regulator, by higher salaries, less travel, and, in some cases, a recruitment bonus.

During the period from FY 2008 to FY 2017, eight examiners (average tenure of 67 months) were hired by credit unions and two examiners (average tenure of 33 months) was hired by NCUA. Another 12 examiners left employment with an average tenure of 30 months.



Examiner Turnover for 10 Years

#### D. Retirement Eligibility

The agency was created in 1969, but through the years, very few employees have remained with the agency until retirement. Based on available information, only eleven employees have retired from the agency. Three retired in the early 1970s soon after the agency became independent from the Banking Department; four employees have retired from 1996-2002, one medically. At the end of FY 2003, two employees retired, prompted by the retirement incentive package authorized by the 78<sup>th</sup> Legislature. Since the beginning of FY 2013, four employees have retired; two in FY2013, one in FY2016 and one more in FY2017. At the current time, three employees are eligible for retirement, six more employees are eligible within the next five years, and an additional four employees are eligible within 8 years. With approximately one-third of staff being eligible to retire within five years, and 44 percent eligible within eight years, proper succession planning will be critical to ensure the identification and development of potential successors for key positions.

# SCHEDULES F. AGENCY WORKFORCE PLAN AND THE TEXAS WORKFORCE SYSTEM STRATEGIC PLAN

#### E. Other Considerations

While there is now an improved beginning salary for examiners, retention of experienced examiners will still be a problem as financial institutions and federal agencies continue to pay higher salaries and require less travel. Agency wide, the turnover rate is expected to stay between 10 to 15 percent annually. The Department continues to assess pay levels, other benefits and work condition enhancements to improve examiner retention.

#### III. Future Workforce Profile

#### A. Critical Functions

- Risk based examination program
- Electronic delivery of examinations
- Offsite monitoring
- E-commerce security

#### **B.** Expected Workforce Changes

• Increased use of technology to revise and streamline work processes

#### C. Anticipated Increase/Decrease in Number of Employees Needed to Do the Work

• The FTE count is anticipated to increase by up to one over the next two years to ensure continuity of service and address the increasing complexity of credit union examinations.

#### D. Future Skills Needed

To effectively perform and process examinations, the agency relies upon a competent and knowledgeable staff. The skills mentioned previously under *Critical Workforce Skills* should be constant for the future; no immediate new skill requirements are anticipated at this time. As employees gain more tenure and experience, their skills should become more refined; employees whose skills do not significantly improve or expand may not be retained.

#### IV. Gap Analysis

#### A. Anticipated Surplus or Shortage of Workers or Skills

After analyzing the workforce information, the Credit Union Department believes that there is only one main gap between the agency's workforce supply and demand that needs to be addressed.

#### 1. Attracting and retaining the right employees for the job

- Competing for business majors with at least 6 hours of accounting
- Younger employees are not staying with the agency
- Assuring experienced, well-performing employees of regular salary increases and competitive salaries

# SCHEDULES F. AGENCY WORKFORCE PLAN AND THE TEXAS WORKFORCE SYSTEM STRATEGIC PLAN

#### V. Strategy Development

Gap	Attracting and Retaining the Right Employees	
Goal	Become an employer of choice and offer career opportunities	
Rationale	There is a competitive job market for qualified individuals with the skills required to perform the duties of an examiner. The agency will continue to reward exceptional performance within statutory limitations, provide staff development through training opportunities, and provide career opportunities, and support innovation and excellence.	
Action Steps	<ul> <li>Continue regular pay increases for high performance</li> <li>Allow employees who are seeking new challenges to work on special projects, or assign development projects</li> </ul>	

Gap	Train and Mentor Less-Tenured Employees	
Goal	Develop staff where they are able to progress to key positions, as those key opportunities become available.	
Rationale	There is a high concentration of existing Department employees in key positions who are either eligible for retirement, or will become so, during the next 8 years. The agency must identify high potential staff and provide them with the tools and training necessary to fill key positions which are vacated due to retirement. Those identified as high potential employees must be placed on a fast track approach for development and know that they have strong career prospects with the Department. The agency will continue to reward exceptional performance within statutory limitations, provide staff development through training opportunities, and provide career opportunities, and support innovation and excellence.	
Action Steps	<ul> <li>Continue regular pay increases for high performance.</li> <li>Allow employees who are seeking new challenges to work on special projects, or assign development projects.</li> <li>Identify above average performers and put them on a fast track approach for their career path.</li> <li>Implement a training approach for high potential staff which focuses on accelerates their development and advancement with the agency.</li> </ul>	

With the exception of increasing the scope of the information technology examination, the Credit Union Department is not anticipating significant changes in the examination process during the next 2-3 years. However, the agency has only 29.5 FTEs and possible retirements could adversely affect the organization in the near future. Within the next 2 years a total of 6 employees, or approximately 20 percent of Department staff, will be eligible for retirement. Proper succession planning will be critical to ensure the identification of staff for key positions if significant turnover occurs due to retirements, whenever that may be. The Department will

# SCHEDULES F. AGENCY WORKFORCE PLAN AND THE TEXAS WORKFORCE SYSTEM STRATEGIC PLAN

need to devote sufficient resources to mentoring and supporting less tenured examiners to ensure they gain the skills and experience to carry out the responsibilities which are needed to progress rapidly with the Department.



# **CREDIT UNION DEPARTMENT**

# **CUSTOMER SERVICE REPORT**

May 2018



# 2018 REPORT ON CUSTOMER SERVICE

The Credit Department is dedicated to fulfilling its commitment to customer service as outlined in the agency's *Compact with Texans*. In doing so, credit unions supervised and regulated by the Department, as well as consumers that have registered complaints about those credit unions, are given the opportunity to provide opinions regarding the level of customer service provided by the agency.

In accordance with TEX. GOV'T CODE CH. 2114, the Department provides a variety of methods for customers to supply feedback about the agency's operations and services. Methods used for the solicitation of feedback include internet-based surveys, outreach meetings, and a convenient link on our public website for customers to discuss issues related to their interaction with the agency.

Inventory of Customers by Strategy		
Strategy Customer		
Safe and Sound Credit Union IndustryTexas-chartered credit union and foreign unions with offices in Texas		
Safeguard the Interest of Credit Union Members	ers Customers (Members) of Texas-chartered credit unions (represented by written complaints received)	

# **External Customer Descriptions**

# **Credit Union Industry**

A safe and sound credit union industry helps ensure economic growth and stability, while assuring a safe place for depositors, available credit opportunities, and competitive financial services. As a result, the primary beneficiary or customer of the Department's safety and soundness supervision of credit unions are the citizens of Texas – credit union members, borrowers, and creditors. Other direct beneficiaries of the Department's examination and supervision are the National Credit Union Administration (NCUA) and the institutions under regulation. The Department must meet the highest expectations and supervisory standards in order to maintain the state's role in enhancing the dual credit union system.

Quality examination and supervision provides credit union boards and management with an independent look at their performance in complying with applicable laws and operating a safe and sound credit union. Burdensome or arbitrary requests for information, improper use of authority, or inconsistently applied statutes, rules, and procedures can inconvenience, disrupt, and even damage credit unions. To monitor the agency's performance as a regulator, the Department surveys credit unions under its jurisdiction. Ultimately, a credit union's members and creditors benefit from examinations and supervision.

## **Credit Union Members**

The primary customers served in this regard are consumers doing business with credit unions such as depositors and borrowers. The Department focuses its surveys on credit union members who have recently gone through the complaint process.

# **Description of Information Gathering Techniques/Methods**

The Department assesses its customer service through communications with its constituents. The Department utilized an electronic survey to reach out to each of its customers.

## **Annual Questionnaire**

Credit unions are sent an invitation by email to participate in an online survey. Responses are anonymous unless the respondent provides contact information. Completed surveys are tabulated automatically by the Department's survey service provider and results are posted on the agency's public website. The methodology of data collection does not follow random sampling guidelines, rather it allows 100% of the credit unions the opportunity to provide feedback. In the most recent annual survey, credit unions were asked to complete the annual survey between March 1, 2018 and May 7, 2018. The agency also emailed reminder notices at various times during the data collection period asking credit unions to participate if they had not already done so.

## **Examination Survey**

The Department solicits input regarding the supervision provided by the agency through a separate post examination survey. The goal of this survey is to help target areas for improvement, as well as to identify what parts of the existing examination process are working well. An invitation by email to participate in an online survey is sent to each credit union 45 days after completion of an examination. The survey covers areas such as the examination process, examination reports, and the examination correspondence.

## **Application Survey**

The Department solicits input regarding its application process through a separate post application survey. The goal of this survey is to help target areas for improvement, as well as to identify what parts of the existing process are working well. An invitation by email to participate in an online survey is sent to each credit union that submits an application 30 days after a final decision is rendered on the application. The survey allows credit unions to provide feedback and rate the performance of the agency in processing the application.

## **Survey of Member Complainants**

Since 2014, complainants of credit unions have been surveyed. The methodology of data collection does not follow random sampling guidelines; it allows 100% of the complainants the opportunity to respond. No deadline for a response is given and the responses are anonymous. Fifteen days after a written consumer complaint is closed, an invitation by email to participate in an online survey is sent

to each complainant. The survey allows complainants to provide feedback and rate the performance of the agency in reviewing their complaint.

# **Results and Summary Analysis of Surveys**

It is important to know that when reviewing the following data, low response rates may generally yield results that reflect the feelings of those with the most positive or negative impressions of, or experiences with, the agency and consequently may skew the analysis of the findings. The results show a general satisfaction by a majority of respondents with the Department's services as a whole across the various surveys.

### **Annual Questionnaire**

The Department received 95 responses from 186 credit unions for a response rate of 51 percent. An overwhelming majority of the respondents "strongly agree" or "somewhat agree" that the Department is conducting its affairs in a satisfactory manner. The questionnaire affirms the agency's dedication to offer exceptional service to credit unions as accessibility, responsiveness, and quality of services were all highly rated.

Strategic Goal: To ensure a safe and sound credit union industryStrategic Objective: The department anticipates, understands, addresses, and communicates risk to credit unions.Measure: Outcome

Interaction with Department			
Q 1. Department Staff is Generally Accessible			
Strongly Agree	80	84%	
Somewhat Agree	9	10%	
Neither Agree or Disagree	4	4%	
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%	
Strongly Disagree	2	2%	
No Opinion	0	0%	
Total	95	100%	

Q 2. Department Staff Provides Timely and Accurate Feedback/Answers		
Strongly Agree	77	81%
Somewhat Agree	12	13%
Neither Agree or Disagree	3	3%
Somewhat Disagree	1	1%
Strongly Disagree	2	2%
No Opinion	0	0%
Total	95	100%

Q 3. Overall, Department Staff is Responsive to My Needs		
Strongly Agree	81	85%
Somewhat Agree	8	9%
Neither Agree or Disagree	3	3%
Somewhat Disagree	1	1%
Strongly Disagree	2	2%
No Opinion	0	0%
Total	95	100%

Q 4. Overall, My Credit Union's Communication with the Department is Satisfactory		
Strongly Agree	79	83%
Somewhat Agree	10	11%
Neither Agree or Disagree	2	2%
Somewhat Disagree	1	1%
Strongly Disagree	3	3%
No Opinion	0	0%
Total	95	100%

Strategic Goal: To ensure a safe and sound credit union industry

**Strategic Objective:** The department anticipates, understands, addresses, and communicates risk to credit unions. **Measure:** Explanatory

Communication with Department		
Q 1. Have you corresponded with the Department about a member complaint within the last 12		
months?		
Yes	34	36%
No	61	64%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	95	100%

Q 2. The Department's requests for information in connection with its review of member complaints strike a reasonable balance between requesting sufficient information to discharge the department's duties and avoiding unnecessarily burdening credit unions

Strongly Agree	31	33%
Somewhat Agree	2	2%
Neither Agree or Disagree	0	0%
Somewhat Disagree	1	1%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	61	64%
Total	95	100%

Q 3. Complaint(s) are handled in a professional manner by the Department		
Strongly Agree	33	35%
Somewhat Agree	1	1%
Neither Agree or Disagree	0	0%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	61	64%
Total	95	100%

Q 4. The Department's response to the complaint was based on a reasonable interpretation of applicable law		
Strongly Agree	32	34%
Somewhat Agree	1	1%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	1%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	61	64%
Total	95	100%

Q 5. The Department's suggestion for resolving the complaint(s) was reasonable		
Strongly Agree	31	33%
Somewhat Agree	1	1%
Neither Agree or Disagree	2	2%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	61	64%
Total	95	100%

Strategic Goal: To ensure a safe and sound credit union industry

**Strategic Objective:** The department anticipates, understands, addresses, and communicates risk to credit unions. **Measure:** Explanatory

	Department Website	
Q 1. The department's website is Informative and easy to use		
Strongly Agree	50	53%
Somewhat Agree	31	33%
Neither Agree or Disagree	9	9%
Somewhat Disagree	2	2%
Strongly Disagree	2	2%
Skipped Question	1	1%
Total	95	100%

Strategic Goal: To ensure a safe and sound credit union industry.

**Strategic Objective:** The department anticipates, understands, addresses, and communicates risk to credit unions. **Measure:** Explanatory

Department Offices		
Q 1. The atmosphere and amenities of the Austin office are conducive to conducting business with		
the department		
Strongly Agree	22	24%
Somewhat Agree	7	7%
Neither Agree or Disagree	56	59%
Somewhat Disagree	4	4%
Strongly Disagree	1	1%
Skipped Question	5	5%
Total	95	100%

Q 2. Parking was adequate and easily accessible		
Strongly Agree	17	18%
Somewhat Agree	16	17%
Neither Agree or Disagree	56	59%
Somewhat Disagree	2	2%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	4	4%
Total	95	100%

**Strategic Goal:** To develop a professional and motivated staff that provides quality service to the citizens of Texas and supports achievement of the department's statutory mission.

Strategic Objective: The department is an efficient, effective, and ethical organization.

Measure: Outcome

Level of Satisfaction Q 1. Overall, the Department provides my credit union with quality service		
Somewhat Agree	8	8%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	1%
Somewhat Disagree	1	1%
Strongly Disagree	3	3%
Skipped Question	4	4%
Total	95	100%

### **Examination Survey**

Forty-five days after the completion of an examination of each credit union, a separate invitation to participate in the examination survey is transmitted to the credit union. For calendar year 2017, 235 invitations were sent and 77 responses were received for a 33 percent response ratio. The responses complimented the examining staff's professionalism and noted that the report of examination was easy to understand with strongly agreed responses exceeding 96 percent.

Strategic Goal: To ensure a safe and sound credit union industryStrategic Objective: The department anticipates, understands, addresses, and communicates risk to credit unions.Measure: Outcome and Efficiency

Examinations		
Q 1. The lead-time was sufficient to gather the information requested prior to the on-site examination		
Strongly Agree	67	87%
Somewhat Agree	7	9%
Neither Agree or Disagree	0	0%
Somewhat Disagree	3	4%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	77	100%

Q 2. The pre-examination requests were reasonable in scope		
Strongly Agree	68	89%
Somewhat Agree	8	10%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	17%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	77	100%

Q 3. Materials requested in the pre-examination were used during the examination		
Strongly Agree	67	87%
Somewhat Agree	7	9%
Neither Agree or Disagree	0	0%
Somewhat Disagree	3	4%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	77	100%

Q 4. The pre-examination request made the examination run more efficiently		
Strongly Agree	69	90%
Somewhat Agree	6	8%
Neither Agree or Disagree	2	2%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	77	100%

Q 5. The examiners were knowledgeable about your credit union		
Strongly Agree	61	79%
Somewhat Agree	12	16%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	1%
Somewhat Disagree	2	3%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	1	1%
Total	77	100%

Q 6. The examiners demonstrated a thorough understanding of safety and soundness issues		
Strongly Agree	62	81%
Somewhat Agree	12	16%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	1%
Somewhat Disagree	1	1%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	1	1%
Total	77	100%

Q 7. The examiners were responsive to your questions and concerns		
Strongly Agree	69	90%
Somewhat Agree	5	7%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	1%
Somewhat Disagree	1	1%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	1	1%
Total	77	100%

Q 8. The examiners communicated effectively with the credit union throughout the examination		
Strongly Agree	70	91%
Somewhat Agree	3	4%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	1%
Somewhat Disagree	2	3%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	1	1%
Total	77	100%

Q 9. The examiners treated you professionally		
Strongly Agree	74	97%
Somewhat Agree	1	1%
Neither Agree or Disagree	0	0%
Somewhat Disagree	1	1%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	1	1%
Total	77	100%

Q 10. The examiners explained the CAMEL ratings in sufficient detail		
Strongly Agree	74	96%
Somewhat Agree	0	0%
Neither Agree or Disagree	2	3%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	1	1%
Total	77	100%

Q 11. All major findings of the examination were discussed with you prior to the examiners leaving your credit union		
Strongly Agree	73	95%
Somewhat Agree	0	0%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	1%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	2	3%
Skipped Question	1	1%
Total	77	100%

Q 12. Management was given the opportunity to react to the examination findings		
Strongly Agree	67	87%
Somewhat Agree	5	7%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	1%
Somewhat Disagree	1	1%
Strongly Disagree	1	1%
Skipped Question	2	3%
Total	77	100%

Q 13. The examination was completed within a reasonable timeframe		
Strongly Agree	71	92%
Somewhat Agree	1	1%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	1%
Somewhat Disagree	2	3%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	2	3%
Total	77	100%

Q 14. The report accurately r examination	eflected the examination findings	as conveyed to you during the
Strongly Agree	72	94%
Somewhat Agree	1	1%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	1%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	1	1%
Skipped Question	2	3%
Total	77	100%

Q 15. The report was easy to understand		
Strongly Agree	74	97%
Somewhat Agree	1	1%
Neither Agree or Disagree	0	0%
Somewhat Disagree	1	1%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	1	1%
Total	77	100%

Q 16. The report accurately portrayed your credit union's practices and condition		
Strongly Agree	63	82%
Somewhat Agree	10	13%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	1%
Somewhat Disagree	1	1%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	2	3%
Total	77	100%

Q 17. The transmittal letter and other written communications concerning the examination report		
was clear and concise		
Strongly Agree	68	88%
Somewhat Agree	5	6%
Neither Agree or Disagree	2	3%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	2	3%
Total	77	100%

Q 18. The report contained useful recommendations for improving safety and soundness practices		
Strongly Agree	66	86%
Somewhat Agree	6	8%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	1%
Somewhat Disagree	1	1%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	3	4%
Total	77	100%

Q 19. The examination findings will assist you in enhancing your safety and soundness practices		
Strongly Agree	65	84%
Somewhat Agree	7	9%
Neither Agree or Disagree	3	4%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	2	3%
Total	77	100%

Q 20. The examination was conducted in a fair and objective manner		
Strongly Agree	68	88%
Somewhat Agree	5	7%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	1%
Somewhat Disagree	1	1%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	2	3%
Total	77	100%

## **Application Survey**

Thirty days after a final decision is rendered on each credit union's application, a separate invitation to participate in the application survey is transmitted to the credit union. For calendar year 2017, 63 invitations were sent and 21 responses were received for a 33 percent response ratio. The responses complimented the Department staff's timely and accurate feedback/answers and the efficient application process with positive responses of 95 percent.

**Strategic Goal:** To provide a flexible regulatory framework that enables credit unions to provide a full competitive array of financial services.

**Strategic** Objective: Credit union application procedures are efficient and consistent with safety and soundness. **Measure:** Outcome

Applications Q 1. Department staff provided timely and accurate feedback/answers		
Somewhat Agree	1	5%
Neither Agree or Disagree	0	0%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	21	100%

Q 2. Department staff communicated with me in a courteous and professional manner		
Strongly Agree	19	90%
Somewhat Agree	1	5%
Neither Agree or Disagree	0	0%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	1	5%
Total	21	100%

Q 3. The application process was efficient		
Strongly Agree	18	86%
Somewhat Agree	3	14%
Neither Agree or Disagree	0	0%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	21	100%

Q 4. The Department's requests for information were reasonable		
Strongly Agree	17	81%
Somewhat Agree	4	19%
Neither Agree or Disagree	0	0%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	21	100%

Q 5. The Department's website was helpful in completing my application		
Strongly Agree	17	81%
Somewhat Agree	4	19%
Neither Agree or Disagree	0	0%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	0	0%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	21	100%

# **Member Complainants**

285 invitations to participate in the survey were transmitted to complainants who filed a complaint against a credit union in calendar year 2017. A total of 25 responses were received for a 9 percent response rate.

Approximately 52 percent of complainants found it relatively easy to file a complaint with the agency. Overall, 64 percent of respondents were satisfied with the assistance received from the Department, while 32 percent were dissatisfied. Strategic Goal: To safeguard the interest of credit union members

**Strategic Objective:** All credit union members have reasonable access to credit union services and are treated fairly and lawfully.

Measure: Explanatory, Efficiency and Outcome

	Complaints	
Q 1. It was relatively easy to file	a complaint with the Department	
Strongly Agree	13	52%
Somewhat Agree	5	20%
Neither Agree or Disagree	2	8%
Somewhat Disagree	3	12%
Strongly Disagree	2	8%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	25	100%

Q 2. Department staff communicated with me in a courteous and professional manner		
Strongly Agree	16	64%
Somewhat Agree	2	8%
Neither Agree or Disagree	2	8%
Somewhat Disagree	2	8%
Strongly Disagree	3	12%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	25	100%

Q 3. I believe department staff understood the basis of my complaint		
Strongly Agree	13	52%
Somewhat Agree	3	12%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	4%
Somewhat Disagree	3	12%
Strongly Disagree	5	20%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	25	100%

Q 4. The response provided by the department addressed the important aspects of my complaint		
Strongly Agree	10	40%
Somewhat Agree	3	12%
Neither Agree or Disagree	0	0%
Somewhat Disagree	3	12%
Strongly Disagree	9	36%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	25	100%

Q 5. The explanation given was fair considering applicable laws		
Strongly Agree	9	36%
Somewhat Agree	4	16%
Neither Agree or Disagree	1	4%
Somewhat Disagree	1	4%
Strongly Disagree	10	40%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	25	100%

Q 6. The Department website was helpful in the complaint process		
Strongly Agree	9	36%
Somewhat Agree	5	20%
Neither Agree or Disagree	6	24%
Somewhat Disagree	0	0%
Strongly Disagree	5	20%
Skipped Question	0	0%
Total	25	100%

# **Customer Service Representative**

The Department's Compact with Texans is posted on the agency's public website (<u>www.cud.texas.gov</u>). The appointed customer service representative is Commissioner Harold E. Feeney.

Credit Union Department 914 East Anderson Lane Austin, Texas 78752-1699 (512) 837-9236

CUDMail@cud.texas.gov